Effects of elevated CO_2 , O_3 and K deficiency on Norway spruce (*Picea abies*): nutrient supply, content and leaching

BY T. PFIRRMANN¹, J. D. BARNES²*, K. STEINER¹, P. SCHRAMEL³, U. BUSCH⁴, H. KÜCHENHOFF⁵ and H.-D. PAYER¹

 ¹GSF-Forschungszentrum für Umwelt und Gesundheit, Expositionskammern, Ingolstädter Landstrasse, D-85758 Oberschleissheim, Germany
 ²Department of Agricultural and Environmental Science, The Ridley Building, The University, Newcastle Upon Tyne NE1 7RU, UK
 ³Institut für Ökologische Chemie, Zentrale Analytik, GSF-Forschungszentrum für Umwelt und Gesundheit, Ingolstädter Landstrasse, D-8042 Oberschleissheim, Germany
 ⁴Dortmund Universität, Fachbereich Statistik, D-44221 Dortmund, Germany
 ⁵Universität München, Seminar für Ökonometrie und Statistik, Akademiestrasse 1, D-80799 München, Germany

(Received 26 February 1996; accepted 29 May 1996)

SUMMARY

Two clones of 5-yr-old Norway spruce (*Picea abies* [L.] Karst.) were exposed to two atmospheric concentrations of CO₂ (350 and 750 μ mol mol⁻¹) and of O₃ (20 and 75 nmol mol⁻¹) in a phytotron at the GSF-Forschungszentrum (Munich) over the course of a single season (April–October). The phytotron was programmed to recreate an artificial climate similar to that at a high elevation site in the Inner Bavarian forest, and trees were grown in 40 l containers of soil (pH 3·5) fertilized to achieve two levels of potassium nutrition; well fertilized and K-deficient. Foliar nutrient analyses performed at the beginning of the exposure indicated that the fertilization programmes achieved their goal without significantly altering the levels of other nutrients or the soil pH. At the beginning of the fumigation, foliar K concentrations were 7–9 mg g⁻¹ d. wt for well fertilized trees and 4–5 mg g⁻¹ d. wt for trees receiving no supplemental K. Over the course of the season, differences between K treatments intensified so that by the end of the experiment there was a five to sixfold difference between foliar K concentrations. This was associated with slight, but significant (P < 0.05), decreases in S and Zn (and of Cu in the 1989 needle year age class) and higher levels of C, N and Mg in K-deficient trees. Foliar N concentrations were low for all trees (9–15 mg g⁻¹ needle d. wt) but were similar to levels found in the field.

Elevated O_3 was found to decrease significantly the C (P < 0.05) and N (P < 0.001) content of both current-year (1989) and previous-year (1988) needles independent of CO_2 concentration, but apart from some minor changes in the concentrations of Cu and Mn in the current-year needles no other effects of the pollutant on plant nutrient status were found. In contrast, CO_2 enrichment resulted in significantly (P < 0.01) lower concentrations of K and P (effects on Mg were also on the borderlines of statistical significance) in current-year needles, but there was no influence on the nutrient composition of the previous-year needles (although effects on N were on the borderlines of statistical significance). CO_2 enrichment also increased (P < 0.05) the C:N ratio of both current-year and

previous-year needles. One factor contributing to the decline in foliar K at elevated CO_2 appeared to be a marked increase (25–30%) in the rate at which cations were leached from the canopy by repeated simulated acid mist (pH 4·0) events, and this effect occurred independently of the O_3 concentration. The information presented will aid the interpretation of parallel studies examining the effects of elevated CO_2 and/or O_3 on seasonal changes in photosynthesis, non-structural carbohydrate content, antioxidants, tree growth and water use efficiency, and sheds further light on the growing scepticism concerning the role of O_3 in the development of Mg and K-deficiency symptoms characteristic of certain types of forest decline in central Europe.

Key words: Elevated CO₂, O₃, nutrient status, nutrient leaching, Picea abies (Norway spruce).

* To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: J.D.Barnes@ncl.ac.uk.

INTRODUCTION

Anthropogenic activities are causing the tropospheric concentrations of carbon dioxide (CO_2) , ozone (O_3) and a number of other trace gases to rise at a steadily increasing rate (Penkett, 1988; Keeling et al., 1989). This has prompted considerable interest in the potential impact of atmospheric change on natural and managed ecosystems. Much work has concentrated on answering the question of how crops will respond to rising CO_2 (e.g. Lemon, 1983; Kimball et al., 1990) and to higher O_3 (Davison & Barnes, 1992; Jäger et al., 1992), but less attention has been paid to the long-term effects of elevated CO_2 on trees (see Eamus & Jarvis, 1989; Ceulemans & Mousseau, 1994) and very little is known about the way in which responses to rising CO₂ might be affected by simultaneous increases in O_3 , and vice versa (Allen, 1990; Barnes, 1993). This represents a serious gap in our current knowledge, since trees and temperate forest ecosystems account for a large proportion of terrestrial atmospheric carbon exchange and influence the hydrology of large areas (Waring & Schlesinger, 1985). It is essential that we understand how forest productivity will be affected by increasing concentrations of CO_2 and O_3 , if we are to be able not only to provide better predictions of future global carbon budgets but also to decide upon policies for the future management of forested ecosystems.

Short-term exposure of a wide variety of tree species to elevated CO_2 has been shown to increase net photosynthesis and plant productivity (Eamus & Jarvis, 1989; Ceulemans & Mousseau, 1994). However, there is growing recognition that this response can only be sustained where other resources, particularly nutrients, are available to support the extra growth induced by CO_2 enrichment (Kirschbaum *et* al., 1994; Gundersson & Wullschleger, 1994; Petterson & McDonald, 1994; Barnes et al., 1995a). One factor influencing the nutrient content of tree foliage is the rate at which cations are leached from the canopy (Tukey, 1970). Several factors are known to influence this process, including the pH, the frequency, duration and intensity of precipitation, as well as the proportion of the foliage surface in contact with a given volume of water (Riederer, 1989; Barnes & Brown, 1990). In conifers, leaching is reduced to a minimum by the hydrophobic nature of the needle surface and the presence of a relatively thick and impermeable cuticle (Martin & Juniper, 1970). However, many factors, including CO₂ (Prügel, 1994), O₃ (Wellburn et al., 1996), acid rain/mist (Riederer, 1989) and nutrient status (Chiu et al., 1992; Ylimarto et al., 1994) are known to influence the nature and functioning of the cuticle and associated epicuticular waxes, as well as to affect membrane permeability (Heath & Castillo, 1988; Marschner, 1986). This suggests that increased foliar

leaching under the combined action of elevated $CO_2 + O_3$ and possibly nutrient deficiency, could exacerbate the direct effects of CO_2 (Oberbauer et al., 1986) and O_3 (Ogner, 1993) on foliar nutrient status, and therefore influence long-term CO₂ responsiveness. This paper reports the results of a season-long study on Norway spruce (Picea abies [L.] Karst.) designed to examine this hypothesis. Cloned trees were exposed in state-of-the-art controlled environment facilities to elevated CO_2 and/or O_3 over the course of a single growing season and effects on soil nutrient availability, nutrient status and leaching were examined. Particular attention was paid to the impact of O_3 on foliar leaching, since the combined action of O_3 and acid mist has received much attention in recent years in relation to the development of forest decline in mountainous areas of central Europe and eastern North America (Bosch et al., 1986; Roberts, Skeffington & Blank, 1989; Taylor, Johnson & Andersen, 1994).

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Tree culture

Two clones (numbers 399 and 773) of Norway spruce (Picea abies [L.] Karst.) originating from a mid-altitude provenance of trees growing in the Bavarian forest (Schongau, provenance number 84019) were provided by the Bavarian Forest Service. In April 1987, when the trees were 3-yr-old, they were lifted from the nursery bed, their roots washed and pruned, and planted four trees per pot in large pots (40 dm³) containing an acidic (pH 3.5) sandy forest soil derived from granite (A_h and B_v-horizons of a dystric Cambisol), which had previously supported the feeder roots of an old forest stand near Speyer (Rhineland-Pfalz). Trees were grown outdoors at Freising Dürnast (Experimental Station of the Institute of Plant Nutrition, Technical University of Munich), situated in a 'clean air' region of Bavaria $(\approx 30 \text{ km north of Munich})$, and selectively fertilized with KNO_3 and K_2SO_4 between August 1987 and March 1989 with the aim of achieving two levels of K nutrition; well fertilized and K-deficient (see Pfirrmann, 1992). One tree per pot was harvested for analytical purposes. The remaining trees were exposed to controlled levels of CO_2 and/or O_3 .

Chamber conditions and exposure details

On 6 April 1989 trees were randomized according to size and transferred to the GSF phytotron (see Payer *et al.*, 1986 *a*, *b*) where they were installed in temperature-controlled compartments providing root temperatures comparable to those under field conditions (see Blank *et al.*, 1990). Into each of four walk-in environment chambers were placed 16 pots



Figure 1. (a) Daily maximum and minimum air temperatures and (b) relative humidity of the four chambers comprising the phytotron. Air temperature was based on 20 yr of continuous monitoring at meteorological stations based at high-elevation (≈ 800 m above sea level) in the Inner Bavarian Forest. Relative humidity was adjusted to a daytime minimum $80 \pm 8 \%$ throughout the exposure period in order to provide undisturbed conditions for stomatal gas exchange. Only during mist periods were higher humidities achieved (final stages of exposure). Individual chamber conditions were virtually identical.

(each containing three trees). At this stage, all chambers were maintained at 15 °C day/8 °C night and ventilated with clean (charcoal/Purafil[®]-filtered) ambient air. After a 26 d period of 'equilibration', CO₂ and O₃ treatments were superimposed on an entirely artificial climate, recreating conditions characteristic of a high elevation site in the Inner Bavarian Forest. The software used to recreate climatic patterns was developed in collaboration with the Institute of Bioclimatology at the University of Munich and was based on data from 20 yr of continuous monitoring at stations belonging to the German Meteorological Office (DWD; see Payer et al., 1986b; Blank et al., 1990). Essentially, the programme consisted of diel changes in light and temperature conditions alternating every 2-7 d on a rotating pattern between cloudy, hazy and sunny days with maximum photon flux densities (PFDs) at midday of 500, 900 and 1150 μ mol m⁻² s⁻¹, respectively (Barnes & Pfirrmann, 1992). Air temperature in the chambers was monitored continuously and was controlled on a dynamic basis between a midday maximum of 23 °C in August and a night-time



Figure 2. Weekly mean May–October atmospheric CO_2 and O_3 concentrations (\pm average daily variations) inside the four experimental chambers which comprise the phytotron. CO_2 treatments ambient (circles) and elevated (squares), O_3 treatments 'non-polluted air' (open symbols) and 'polluted air' (closed symbols). Chambers were initially ventilated with clean ambient air before starting the treatments on day 26.

minimum of 8 °C (± 0.5 K) in April and October (Fig. 1*a*). The relative humidity was maintained at $80\pm 8\%$ in order to provide undisturbed conditions for stomatal gas exchange. Only during misting periods were higher humidities achieved (see Fig. 1*b*). Radiation was provided by metal-halide, xenonarc and krypton floodlamps producing a spectrum close to that occurring in the field (between 350 and 800 nm). Radiation in the near-ultra-violet (u.v.-A: 320–380 nm) was $\approx 50\%$ lower than that under field conditions, u.v.-B (280–320 nm) was less than 10% of that found in the field, and no u.v.-C was detectable (< 280 nm). PFDs lower than found in the field were compensated for by extending the period of maximum (noon time) illumination. In this

way, cumulative PFDs comparable to those in field conditions were achieved. Between May and October, air temperature, relative humidity and PFD were virtually identical in the four chambers. Trees were watered by a computer-controlled irrigation system governed by data acquired from tensiometers placed in each of the pots. This system was programmed to re-water the plants to field capacity when the soil water tension dropped to 150 hPa (Pfirrmann, 1992). Evaporation from the soil surface was prevented by fitting a polyethylene cover over the surface of each pot. These covers also prevented the percolation of throughfall into the soil.

Between 2 May and 24 October two chambers were maintained at ambient CO_2 by ventilating with filtered air drawn from outside the building, whilst the other two chambers were maintained at elevated CO₂ by injecting CO₂ into the ambient air stream from cylinders to maintain a target atmospheric CO_2 concentration of $300 \,\mu \text{mol mol}^{-1}$ above external (i.e. target concentrations concentration С. 750 μ mol CO₂ mol⁻¹ dry air). The atmospheric CO₂ concentration in the 'ambient' chambers was slightly higher (on average $\approx 5\%$) than background levels owing to the presence of researchers and technicians caring for plants and undertaking experimental duties within the chambers. Ozone, produced by electric discharge from pure oxygen, was continuously injected into individual chambers to maintain target O_3 concentrations of 20 nmol mol⁻¹ ('nonpolluted' air) or 75 nmol mol⁻¹ ('polluted' air) for 24 h d^{-1} (see Fig. 2). SO₂ and NO₂ were injected into all the chambers to provide a constant background level of $8-15 \text{ nmol mol}^{-1}$ for 24 h d⁻¹. Comprehensive details of gas-control systems and analytical methods are provided elsewhere (Payer et al., 1986 a, *b*).

Soil analysis

Before the beginning (March, 1989) and at the end of the experiment (October, 1989) pots in which the two clones had been growing were selected at random for soil analyses. Soil was removed from a depth of 0-5 cm, separated as described in Pfirrmann et al. (1990) and the d. wt recorded after 2 d at 105 °C. Extracts of fine soil were shaken overnight in 0.1 M KCl, allowed to settle for 2 h and then the soilpH was determined using a glass electrode. Exchangeable cations were determined in percolates of 2.5 g fine soil and 100 ml of unbuffered 1 M NH₄Cl as described by Meiwes et al. (1984). The concentrations of Al, K, Ca, Fe, Mg, Mn and Na in percolate samples of fine soil were determined by ICP-analysis (see Schramel, 1988). All analyses were carried out on two replicates of each sample. Effective cation exchange capacity (CECeff) was calculated from the sum of the equivalents of the exchangeable cations (Meiwes et al., 1984).

exposure to a sequence of acid mists in October. Fine root sample (< 2 mm diam.) were extracted from just beneath the soil surface at six positions marked at random on the surface of each pot. Plant material was washed in deionized water, cleaned, dried to constant weight in an oven (65 °C) and then ground. P, S, K, Ca, Mg, Al, Cu, Fe, Mn and Zn contents were determined by ICP analysis (Schramel, 1988), and those of C and N using a Carlo Erba analyser (Steffen & Schramel, 1988).

Throughfall chemistry

Towards the end of the exposure period (days 160–172) all trees were exposed to artificial acid mist (eight events). Mist events consisted of applying deionized water enriched with $(\mathrm{NH}_4)_2\mathrm{SO}_4$ (18 mg l⁻¹), adjusted to pH 4.0 with H_2SO_4 , for 6 min in every 10, for 12 h overnight, with the mist applied from glass spray units in the roof of each chamber (see Blank et al., 1990; Pfirrmann et al., 1990). Throughfall was collected in perspex trays connected to the lid of each pot, and 25 ml aliquots were analysed for K, Mg and Ca as described in Pfirrmann et al. (1990), correcting for the levels of specific elements in 'blank' leachates collected from nylon 'trees'.

Statistical analyses

The experiment involved the exposure of 192 trees to controlled levels of CO₂ and O₃, the smallest possible cell comprising two pots holding six plants. The influence and interaction of CO₂, O₃, K status and clone were determined by analysis of variance (ANOVA) using linear models for unbalanced data because of missing values. After each ANOVA, the residuals were tested for normal distribution. Since it was not possible to assign root samples to individual trees within each pot, these data were analysed using the 'pot' as the unit of replication. Time-course data were first subjected to a repeated measures ANOVA (RM-ANOVA) model to test the effects of time, group factors and interactions between them (see Barnes *et al.*, 1995a). All effects involving the factor 'time' were tested by the univariate F-test method, with adjustment for the degrees of freedom (Geisser & Greenhouse, 1958). This indicated that only two- and three-way interactive effects of time with CO2 and O3 were significant (P < 0.05), so the data were re-analysed using a reduced multivariate ANOVA (MANOVA) model concentrating only on those factors which were significant. Finally, the data gathered at each sampling time were subjected to an ANOVA. Because of the complex experimental design and the length of the fumigation it was not possible to repeat

Tissue nutrient analysis

Current- [1989] and previous [1988]-year needles were harvested at the beginning (April, 1989) and end of the experiment (October, 1989) from the uppermost whorl of one tree in each pot. One tree per pot was removed prior to budburst and trees of clone 773 were destructively sampled following treatments in different chambers, so all analyses were made on the assumption that two plants grown in different chambers receiving the same treatment were likely to be as different as (or as similar to) plants in the same chamber (see Barnes & Pfirrmann, 1992). This assumption was supported by the results of a preceding experiment in which spruce trees were exposed to a combination of O_3 and acid mist, using an experimental design in which trees were treated in replicated chambers (Blank *et al.*, 1990).

RESULTS

Soil analyses

In March 1989, analyses revealed the principal difference achieved by the contrasting fertilization procedures to be the level of soil potassium. Well fertilized soil exhibited a level of exchangeable K of $3.65 \ \mu \text{mol g}^{-1}$ fine soil, 65 % higher than that of soil receiving no supplemental K (2.21 $\mu \text{mol g}^{-1}$ fine

soil). Analyses showed that neither soil pH nor the availability of any other element was significantly affected by the fertilization treatment.

Plant growth, and additional fertilization during the period of the experiment intensified the differences between K treatments, so that by October 1989 the level of exchangeable K in soil receiving supplemental fertilization was ≈ 3.5 -fold higher than that of soil which received no K fertilizer. There was also c. 30% difference in the levels of soil sulphur induced by the contrasting fertilization regimes (data not shown). Table 1 shows the results of soil nutrient analyses conducted in October 1989. Three and four-way interactions have been omitted as no significant effects were found at this level of analysis. The data reveal that contrasting K fertilization programmes achieved their goal. There were no significant differences between fertilization treatments in exchangeable Al, Ca and Mg (nor in Mn and Na-data not shown), but fertilization during the period of the experiment resulted in 20-25 %

Table 1. Summary of soil analyses on NH_4Cl percolates of fine soil following a season-long exposure of Norway spruce¹ (Picea abies) to elevated CO_2 (750 vs. 350 µmol mol⁻¹) and/or O_3 (75 vs. 20 nmol mol⁻¹) superimposed on an entirely artificial climate recreating that at a high altitude site in the Bavarian Forest

				and the second se		and a second sec							
Trea	tment		Soil n	Soil nutrient composition									
O_3	CO_2	Soil	Al	K	Mg	Ca	Fe	CECeff*	pН				
20	350	+ K	34.3	3.71	7.3	5.8	2.77	57.2	3.53				
20	350	-K	27.2	0.15	6.7	4.2	2.29	43.9	3.53				
20	750	+K	37.5	3.98	9.6	11.5	3.23	69.4	3.52				
20	750	-K	40.2	1.11	$7 \cdot 2$	7.9	2.61	61.9	3.56				
75	350	+K	34.0	5.61	4.0	4.5	5.08	56.6	3.52				
75	350	-K	34.8	1.88	12.5	8.3	2.36	63.0	3.53				
75	750	+K	34.9	3.65	12.4	7.4	3.57	65.8	3.50				
75	750	-K	37.9	1.39	6.4	4.9	2.94	53.4	3.54				
			Effect	s									
O.,			n.s.	n.s.	n.s.	n.s.	**	n.s.	n.s.				
٢Ô.			**	n.s.	n.s.	(*)	n.s.	*	n.s.				
$O_{a} \stackrel{2}{\times}$	CO.		*	n.s.	n.s.	*	n.s.	*	n.s.				
Soil			n.s.	**	n.s.	n.s.	***	(*)	n.s.				
$O_{2} \times$	soil		n.s.	n.s.	(*)	n.s.	*	n.s.	n.s.				
CÔ.	\times soil		*	n.s.	n.s.	n.s.	(*)	n.s.	n.s.				
Clon	e		***	n.s.	n.s.	n.s.	***	*** **					

Soil was collected from the A_h and B_v horizons of a hydristic cambisol which had previously supported the feeder roots of an old forest stand in the Rhineland–Pfalz region. Over a 3-yr period, fertilizer amendments were made with the aim of achieving two levels of K nutrition evaluated through soil effects; well fertilized (+K), potassium-deficient (-K). Nutrient concentrations expressed as μ mol g⁻¹ fine soil d. wt.

Significance of main effects: n.s., not significant, *P < 0.1; *P < 0.05; **P < 0.01: ***P < 0.001.

¹ Data represent the mean for two clones – interactions between clone and other factors were not significant.

* Total effective cation exchange capacity = equivalent sum of Al, Ca, Fe, K, Mg, Mn and Na.

Table 2. Effects of a season-long exposure to elevated CO_2 (750 vs. 350 µmol mol⁻¹) and/or O_3 (20 vs. 75 nmol mol⁻¹ 24 h d⁻¹) on the nutrient composition of fine roots (< 2 mm diam.) of Norway spruce (Picea abies clone 773) grown in a native forest soil fertilized to achieve two levels of potassium nutrition; well fertilized (+K), potassium-deficient (-K)

Trea	atment		Fine root nutrient composition										
O_3	CO_2	Soil	N	K	Mg	Ca	S	Р	Zn	Mn			
20 20 20 20 75 75 75 75 75	$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		9.5 10.5 10.2 7.4 11.3 11.1 9.8 10.6 Effects	$ \begin{array}{r} 17.5 \\ 4.8 \\ 15.8 \\ 3.2 \\ 20.1 \\ 4.0 \\ 12.9 \\ 4.8 \\ \end{array} $	$ \begin{array}{c} 1 \cdot 20 \\ 0 \cdot 95 \\ 0 \cdot 95 \\ 0 \cdot 95 \\ 0 \cdot 98 \\ 0 \cdot 94 \\ 1 \cdot 15 \\ 0 \cdot 87 \\ \end{array} $	0.54 1.16 0.42 1.34 0.63 1.17 0.51 0.74	358 153 175 107 380 304 267 209	3.98 2.83 3.87 1.82 4.75 2.35 3.51 2.45	56.9 49.1 44.6 71.0 46.2 53.0 56.7 94.3	$22.5 \\ 53.0 \\ 20.7 \\ 51.5 \\ 25.4 \\ 40.1 \\ 22.9 \\ 30.6$			
O_3 CO_2 $O_3 \times$ Soil Soil Soil $O_3 \times$	$\begin{array}{c} \mathrm{CO}_2 \\ \times \mathrm{O}_3 \\ \times \mathrm{CO}_2 \\ \mathrm{CO}_2 \times \mathrm{S} \end{array}$	soil	n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s.	n.s. ** n.s. *** n.s. **	n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s.	n.s. n.s. n.s. ** n.s. n.s. n.s.	* ** n.s. ** n.s. n.s. n.s.	n.s. n.s. n.s. ** n.s. n.s. n.s.	n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s.	n.s. n.s. ** (*) n.s. n.s.			

Element concentrations: N, K, Mg, Ca, P (mg g⁻¹ d. wt); S, Zn, Mn (μ g g⁻¹ d. wt).

Significance of main effects: n.s., not significant; *P < 0.1; *P < 0.05; **P < 0.01; ***P < 0.001.

higher (P < 0.001) levels of Fe by the time of the final harvest, although all pots received equivalent amounts of Fe during fertilization. The contrasting fertilization treatments were reflected in slight (15-25%) differences in total effective cation exchange capacity (CECeff; P < 0.01). There were also significant (P < 0.01) effects of clone on soil pH and on the availability of certain nutrients (e.g. higher levels of exchangeable Al and Fe in the soil supporting clone 399) and they were reflected in significant differences in CECeff between clones (see Table 1). Growth at elevated CO_2 and/or O_3 affected the availability of certain nutrients in soil; O_3 exposure significantly (P < 0.01) increased the level of exchangeable Fe, whilst elevated CO_2 increased Al (P < 0.01) and CECeff (P < 0.05).

Fine-root nutrient content

Foliar nutrient analyses

Needle nutrient composition was determined before and after season-long exposure to elevated CO_2 and/or O₃. There were significant differences between clones, but both responded to CO_2 , O_3 and K fertilization in approximately the same way so data are presented and discussed independently of clone (see Table 3). Needle K content reflected the contrasting programmes of fertilization. Prior to budburst in 1989, the K content of the previous-year needles was 7-9 mg K g⁻¹ needle d. wt for well fertilized trees (+K), and 4–5 mg K g⁻¹ needle d. wt for trees grown in K deficient soil (-K). Over the course of the experiment these differences intensified (see Tables 3, 4). Foliar nutrient analyses performed in April 1989 revealed similar levels of all elements, other than K, in trees grown in the two soils.

The influence of season-long exposure to elevated CO_2 and/or O_3 on the nutrient composition of fine roots of clone 773 is shown in Table 2. Major differences in fine-root nutrient composition were associated with soil fertilization regime; K fertilization resulting in significantly higher concentrations of K, S and P and lower concentrations of Al, Ca and Mn. However, significant effects of O_3 and CO_2 on specific nutrients were also found; O_3 exposure increasing the S concentration in fine roots, whilst elevated CO_2 decreased Al, K and S concentrations.

However, by the end of the experiment (October 1989), K deficiency was associated with significantly (30%) lower concentrations of S and Zn (and of Cu in 1989 needles) and significantly (P < 0.01) higher levels of C, N and Mg (Tables 3, 4).

 O_3 exposure resulted in a significant decrease in the C (P < 0.05) and N (P < 0.001) contents of current-year and previous-year needles independent of CO₂ concentration, and in the current-year needles the effect was associated with an increase in Cu and a decrease in Mn content (Tables 3, 4). O₃ exposure had no significant influence on needle

Table 3. Effects of a season-long exposure to elevated CO_2 (750 vs. 350 µmol mol⁻¹) and/or O_3 (75 vs. 20 nmol mol⁻¹ 24 h d⁻¹), superimposed on an entirely artificial climate re-creating that at a high elevation site in the Bavarian Forest, on the nutrient composition of current [1989] year needles of Norway spruce (Picea abies)

Treatment			Nut	Nutrient composition of 1989 needle year									
O ₃	CO_2	Soil	С	Ν	К	Mg	Ca	S	Р	Cu	Zn	Fe	Mn
20 20 20 75 75 75 75	350 350 750 750 350 350 750 750	+ K - K + K - K + K - K + K - K	474 489 463 491 471 475 458 487 Effe	15.4 13.4 14.5 14.6 9.4 12.6 10.3 15.3 cts	$ \begin{array}{r} 15.6 \\ 1.9 \\ 11.3 \\ 2.0 \\ 12.9 \\ 2.2 \\ 11.2 \\ 1.9 \\ \end{array} $	1.94 2.02 1.35 2.33 1.70 2.44 1.30 2.14	5.11 3.29 5.25 5.13 4.85 5.22 4.98 3.05	503 327 473 377 518 385 466 335	2.58 1.87 1.78 2.15 2.20 2.13 1.73 1.99	1.54 1.05 1.58 1.47 1.96 1.81 1.73 1.18	35·3 18·5 24·8 21·0 25·5 17·8 29·8 13·0	47.5 31.0 33.6 34.9 46.7 34.1 33.3 39.9	385 300 357 328 286 300 258 244
O_3 CO_2 $O_3 \times$ Soil Soil Soil $O_3 \times$ Clon	$CO_2 \times O_3 \times CO_2 CO_2 \times se$	oil	* n.s. *** n.s. ** n.s. **	*** n.s. (*) ** n.s. n.s. n.s.	n.s. * n.s. *** n.s. n.s. n.s.	n.s. (*) n.s. *** n.s. (*) n.s. n.s.	n.s. n.s. (*) n.s. n.s. (*) (*)	n.s. n.s. *** n.s. n.s. n.s. ***	n.s. * n.s. n.s. ** n.s. n.s.	* n.s. ** n.s. (*) ***	n.s. n.s. ** n.s. n.s. n.s. ***	n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. ** n.s. n.s.	* n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. **

Trees were grown in a native forest soil fertilized to achieve two levels of potassium nutrition; well fertilized (+K), potassium-deficient (-K). Data represent the mean of two clones (nos 773 and 399). Element concentrations: C, N, K, Mg, Ca, P (mg g⁻¹ d. wt); S, Cu, Zn, Fe, Mn (μ g g⁻¹ d. wt). Significance of main effects: n.s., not significant; *P < 0.1; *P < 0.05; **P < 0.01; ***P < 0.001.

concentrations of K, Mg, Ca, S, P, Zn and Fe (nor on Cu and Mn in 1988 needles), nor on the C/N ratio of foliage.

By contrast, CO_2 enrichment resulted in significantly lower concentrations of K and P (effects on Mg were also on the borderlines of statistical significance) in current-year needles, but there was no influence on the nutrient composition of the previous-year needles (although effects on N were on the borderlines of statistical significance). The C/N ratio of both current-year and previous-year needles was increased (P < 0.05). There was little evidence of interactions between elevated CO_2 and O_3 .

Throughfall chemistry

same so throughfall chemistry results are presented and discussed independently of clone and soil.

Initial misting events resulted in high concentrations of K, Mg and Ca in throughfall, but the rate at which nutrients were leached from foliage declined with subsequent mist episodes and attained a constant level after the 4th application. The actual losses of nutrients, calculated from misting volumes and leaching concentrations, represented less than 4% of the needle contents. RM-ANOVA revealed that the throughfall collected from CO₂-enriched trees contained significantly higher concentrations (25–30% averaged over 12 d misting period) of K (P < 0.05), Mg (P < 0.05) and Ca (P < 0.01). By contrast, O₃ per se had no significant effect on the K, Mg and Ca contents of throughfall, and CO₂-induced

Figure 3 shows the effects of season-long exposure to elevated CO_2 and/or O_3 on the K, Mg and Ca contents of throughfall following successive simulated acid (pH 4·0) mist episodes. Significant differences in throughfall chemistry were found between clones; trees of clone 399 generally exhibiting higher rates of nutrient leaching. K-deficient trees exhibited c. 50 % lower levels of K in throughfall, but there were no significant effects on Mg and Ca concentrations. Responses to CO_2 and/or O_3 (and generally fertilization) were, however, generally the increases in leaching were maintained in the presence of higher concentrations of O_3 .

DISCUSSION

Only one chamber was used for each of the two carbon dioxide and ozone concentration treatments employed in this study. However, since the climatic conditions and gas concentrations in the treatment chambers were almost identical, and previous experiments had shown no significant differences in

Table 4. Effects of a season-long exposure to elevated CO_2 (750 vs. 350 µmol mol⁻¹) and/or O_3 (75 vs. 20 nmol mol⁻¹ 24 h d⁻¹), superimposed on an entirely artificial climate recreating that at a high elevation site in the Bavarian Forest, on the nutrient composition of previous (1988) year needles of Norway spruce (Picea abies)

Treatment			Nutrient composition of 1988 needle year										
O ₃	CO_2	Soil	С	Ν	K	Mg	Ca	S	Р	Cu	Zn	Fe	Mn
20 20 20 20 75 75 75 75 75	350 350 750 750 350 350 350 750 750	+ K - K + K - K + K - K + K - K	479 490 471 494 478 478 472 467 490	12.5 14.7 11.3 13.8 11.9 13.8 10.7 12.9	9.66 1.71 9.23 1.78 8.99 1.76 8.91 1.62	2.02 2.75 1.99 2.67 1.69 2.87 1.77 2.70	$12.8 \\ 12.4 \\ 14.8 \\ 13.4 \\ 12.0 \\ 14.8 \\ 11.6 \\ 13.2$	521 423 528 433 454 442 493 401	1.46 1.33 1.47 1.39 1.17 1.29 1.53 1.37	1.94 1.94 2.15 2.26 2.43 2.23 2.01 1.91	$\begin{array}{c} 68.9\\ 38.9\\ 69.7\\ 55.7\\ 53.6\\ 50.4\\ 64.3\\ 52.6\end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 64{\cdot}4\\ 78{\cdot}5\\ 62{\cdot}6\\ 63{\cdot}5\\ 615\\ 85{\cdot}7\\ 50{\cdot}2\\ 64{\cdot}4 \end{array}$	710 710 661 637 691 779 620 738
			Effe	ets									
O_3 CO_2 $O_3 \times$ Soil Soil $O_3 \times$ Clon	CO_2 × O_3 × CO_2 CO_2 × s	oil	* n.s. *** n.s. n.s. n.s. **	* (*) n.s. ** n.s. n.s. n.s. **	n.s. n.s. *** n.s. *** ***	n.s. n.s. *** * n.s. ***	n.s. n.s. n.s. * n.s. n.s. n.s.	n.s. n.s. *** n.s. n.s. n.s. ***	n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. *	n.s. ** n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. ***	n.s. n.s. * n.s. n.s. n.s. ***	n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. (*)	n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s. n.s.

Trees were grown in a native forest soil fertilized to achieve two levels of potassium nutrition; well fertilized (+K), potassium-deficient (-K). Data represent the means of two clones (nos 773 and 399). Element concentrations: C, N, K, Mg, Ca, P, (mg g⁻¹ d. wt); S, Cu, Zn, Fe, Mn (μ g g⁻¹ d. wt). Significance of main effects: n.s., not significant; *P < 0.1; *P < 0.05; **P < 0.01; ***P < 0.001.

tree growth between chambers (Blank *et al.*, 1990), there seemed no reason to expect significant chamber-to-chamber variation other than with regard to the factors under investigation. This expectation was confirmed by routine measurements of light, temperature, humidity, CO_2 and O_3 in the individual chambers comprising the phytotron (Figs. 1, 2).

Soil, fine-root and foliar nutrient analyses indicated that contrasting fertilization programmes aimed at two levels of K nutrition achieved their goal. At the beginning of the experiment, in April 1989, K concentrations were 7–9 mg K g^{-1} needle d. wt for well fertilized trees and $4-5 \text{ mg K g}^{-1}$ needle d. wt for trees grown in soil receiving no additional K fertilizer, a level comparable with that in healthy and chlorotic spruce needles in the Calcareous Bavarian Alps (Polle et al., 1992) and regarded as approaching deficiency levels (Hüttl, 1985). Differences in foliar K intensified over the course of the season and although they were associated with a decline in the foliar concentrations of S, Zn, and also of Cu in the 1989 needles, K was the only nutrient whose level approached concentrations that would normally be regarded as limiting to the growth of Norway spruce (Hüttl, 1985). Foliar N concentrations were low for all trees $(9-15 \text{ mg g}^{-1} \text{ d. wt})$ but, as for the majority of elements, were similar to those reported for spruce in the Calcareous Bavarian Alps (see Pfirrmann *et al.*, 1990; Polle *et al.*, 1992). S and Cu levels were, however, somewhat lower than those reported for trees in the Bavarian Alps, whereas Mn levels were higher (see Polle *et al.*, 1992).

K availability is an important factor determining tree growth and vitality in certain parts of central Europe, but few controlled studies have addressed the effects of K deficiency *per se* on tree physiology (see Keller & Matyssek, 1990). In the present study, one of the most noticeable effects of K deficiency was the relative increase in the amount of K leached from needles. Although foliar K concentrations were reduced by five to sixfold in K-deficient trees, chemical analyses revealed a decrease of only 50 % in the amount of K appearing in throughfall. This observation is consistent with the reported effects of K deficiency on conifer needle cuticles (see Ylimarto *et al.*, 1994).

Soil analyses showed that exposure of trees to elevated CO_2 and/or O_3 resulted in subtle changes in the availability of certain elements in soil (Table 1). CO_2 enrichment, for example, was found to increase soil CECeff, an indicator of general soil condition (Meiwes *et al.*, 1984). The percolation of throughfall into the soil was prevented by a polythene cover I

-

(a)

ų

5

3

2



and/or O₃ on the K, Mg and Ca concentrations in throughfall collected following a series of simulated acid mist (pH 4.0) events. Data presented is averaged over K treatments and clone, as these factors did not influence the response to elevated CO_2 and/or O_3 . Ambient CO_2 (circles), elevated CO₂ (squares), 'non-polluted air' (open symbols), 'polluted air' (closed symbols). Vertical bars indicate the LSD calculated at the 5% level.

fitted to the surface of each pot, and direct effects of CO2 enrichment on soil microbial activity would not be expected because rhizosphere CO₂ concentrations are naturally higher than 700 μ mol mol⁻¹ in any case

thetic carbon gain resulting from CO₂ enrichment (see Barnes et al., 1995 a) might have been reflected in a substantially increased rate of carbon input into the rhizosphere, which, combined with an increase in root size (Pfirrmann, 1992), stimulated microbial activity and increased CECeff. It remains to be established whether similar effects occur in the field in response to prolonged CO2 enrichment because longer-term exposure to elevated CO_2 has been shown to increase the C/N ratio of litter through increases in carbon-based secondary compounds such as lignin and tannins (Fajer, Bowers & Bazzaz, 1992), and this might reduce decomposition and nitrogen mineralization processes, leading to a progressive immobilization of nutrients in the soil (Kirschbaum et al., 1994).

Elevated CO_2 reduced the K and P (and effects on Mg were on the borderlines of statistical significance) contents of current-year needles, but had no significant influence on the nutrient composition of the previous-year needles (although effects on N were on the borderline of statistical significance). This implies that uptake and transfer of these nutrients into the current-year needles did not satisfy the demand generated by enhanced growth at elevated CO₂ (see Norby, O'Neill & Luxmore, 1986; O'Neill, Luxmore & Norby, 1987; Polle et al., 1993). However, care needs to be taken in the interpretation of these data because starch accumulated in the needles of CO_2 -enriched trees over the course of the season (Barnes et al., 1995a). Losses of K, Mg and Ca in throughfall were of the same low order of magnitude as observed during previous experiments (Pfirrmann et al., 1990), but cannot be neglected. One factor contributing to the decline in the K and Mg contents of the current-year needles of CO₂-enriched trees appeared to be the elevated rate at which these elements were leached from the foliage of trees exposed to elevated CO_2 (Fig. 3). The reason for this is unclear. However, recent work has shown that CO_2 enrichment can induce marked changes in the chemical composition of the waxes on the surface of spruce needles (Prügel, 1994) and this would be expected to cause changes in needle wettability, a factor known to affect the rate at which cations are leached from foliage (see Wellburn et al., 1996). The observation that elevated CO₂ may increase the rate at which cations, and possibly other solutes, are

(Scheffer & Schachtschabel, 1989), so the most likely explanation for the effect of elevated CO₂ on CECeff is an effect on soil microbial activity via the impact of elevated CO₂ on the above-soil parts of the tree. Microbial biomass/activity is known to be greater in the rhizosphere and bulk soil of plants grown at elevated CO2 (Zak et al., 1993) and this is highly contingent with the increased excretion of carbohydrates from the roots of plants growing under CO₂-enriched conditions (Norby et al., 1987). We suggest therefore that the increased net photosynleached from foliage has far-reaching implications, and the mechanisms underlying these effects are worthy of further investigation. Decreased foliar concentrations of N, P, K, Ca and Mg have commonly been reported in trees, and also in herbaceous species, in response to CO₂ enrichment, but enhanced leaching of nutrients from foliage has not previously been considered as a contributing factor (see Oberbauer et al., 1986; Brown, 1991). Over the past decade, considerable attention has been paid to the effects of O₃ on Norway spruce

276 T. Pfirrmann and others

because of suggestions that the pollutant contributes to the development of the regional-specific nutrient disorders characteristic of particular types of forest decline in mountainous areas of central Europe (see Roberts et al., 1989). However, in recent years the role of O_3 (Sandermann, Wellburn & Heath, 1996), and even the very existence of a widespread form of 'novel' forest decline, has been increasingly questioned (Skelly & Innes, 1994). In the present study, exposure to a seasonal O_3 regime realistic for highaltitude areas of the Bavarian Forest resulted in few significant changes in foliar nutrient composition and there was no evidence that O_3 influenced the rate at which K, Mg and Ca were leached from foliage. These observations lend further support to the argument that reports in the mid-1980s of increased foliar leaching induced by 'ozone' resulted from contamination of the O₃ used to fumigate trees (see Brown & Roberts, 1988). The present study was restricted to a single growing season, so longer-term effects cannot be discounted (Lucas, Rantanen & Mehlhorn, 1993). However, given the present findings, a mechanism for such longer-term effects is difficult to reconcile and it is noteworthy that a number of experiments on Norway spruce conducted over several seasons have revealed no significant effects of long-term O3 exposure on foliar nutrient composition (Roberts et al., 1989; Pfirrmann et al., 1990; Ogner, 1993; Rantanen, Palomäki & Holopainen, 1994). The present study therefore lends further support to the growing scepticism concerning the role of O₃ in the development of Mg and K deficiency symptoms typical of 'declining' trees at higher elevations in the German 'Mittelgebirge' and Bavarian Forest.

Research into the combined effects of elevated CO_2 and O_3 on plant growth, physiology and biochemistry is still at an early stage (see Barnes & Pfirrmann, 1992; Van der Eerden *et al.*, 1993; Barnes, Ollerenshaw & Whitfield, 1995*b*; Barnes *et al.*, 1995*a*; Balaguer *et al.*, 1995). There is a widely held opinion that CO_2 -induced decreases in stomatal conductance will afford additional protection against O_3 damage (Allen, 1990). However, recent experiments on wheat (Barnes *et al.*, 1995*b*), spruce (Barnes *et al.*, 1995*a*), birch (Mortensen, 1995) and clover (Van der Eerden *et al.*, 1993) have revealed that

with data consistent with changes in plants under natural conditions, it is clearly important to undertake larger-scale in situ experiments on mature woody species. However, there is an immediate need to improve our understanding of the way in which the impact of elevated atmospheric concentrations of CO_2 on tree growth and physiology will be influenced by other environmental factors (e.g. gaseous air pollutants, nutrient limitations, pests and pathogens, soil-moisture deficit and winter stress). At the present time this information can only be obtained realistically in smaller-scale controlledenvironment studies, although there is a clear need for longer-term studies to be conducted in the field. Further work is urgently required to improve our present knowledge of plant, and in particular tree, responses to the combination of rising CO_2 and O_3 (Garrec, Laitat & Rose, 1993). It is important that we understand how plants will respond to this combination of gases, not only to define the mechanisms involved in the modification of plant responses to complex changes in climate and atmosphere, but also to permit the correct interpretation of plant responses to elevated CO_2 and mixtures of pollutants in studies employing controlledenvironment chambers, open-top chambers and open-field exposure systems.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors acknowledge the assistance of Mr F. Wania and the technical staff of the EPOKA group at the GSF without whose support this study could not have been undertaken. We are grateful to the nursery at Freising Dürnast for cultivating the plant material and to Schering AG and BASF AG for providing fertilizers free of charge. The study was financed by the Commission of the European Communities (Contract No. EV4V-0025-D) and the work was written up by JDB during the tenure of a Royal Society Research Fellowship.

REFERENCES

- Allen LH. 1990. Plant responses to rising carbon dioxide and potential interactions with air pollutants. *Journal of Environmental Quality* 19: 15-34.
- **Balaguer L, Barnes JD, Panicucci A, Borland AM. 1995.** Production and utilization of assimilates in wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) leaves exposed to elevated O₃ and/or CO₂. New

although the growth of O_3 -treated plants may be stimulated by higher CO_2 , the relative impact of O_3 is commonly the same at ambient and elevated CO_2 , despite additive effects of the gases on stomatal conductance in some cases. The lack of significant $CO_2 \times O_3$ interactions in the present study was consistent with previous observations, since the combined effects of the gases on nutrient supply, content and throughfall chemistry were no more or less than additive.

Given that large-scale models of regional and global vegetation dynamics require parameterization

Phytologist **129**: 557–568.

- Barnes JD. 1993. Report of atmospheric pollution working group. In: Jackson MB, Black CR, eds. Interacting Stresses on Plants in a Changing Climate vol. 16, NATO-ASI Series, Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 743-748.
- Barnes JD, Brown KA. 1990. The influence of ozone and acid mist on the amount and wettability of the surface waxes in Norway spruce (*Picea abies* [L.] Karst.). New Phytologist 114: 531-535.
- **Barnes JD, Pfirrmann T. 1992.** The influence of CO_2 and O_3 , singly and in combination, on gas exchange, growth and nutrient status of radish (*Raphanus sativus* L.). New Phytologist **121**: 403–412.
- Barnes JD, Pfirrmann T, Steiner K, Lütz C, Busch U, Küchenhoff, Payer H-D. 1995*a*. Effects of elevated CO_2 , elevated O_3 and K deficiency on Norway spruce (*Picea abies*)

(L.) Karst.). Seasonal changes in photosynthesis and nonstructural carbohydrate content. *Plant*, *Cell and Environment* **118**: 1345–1357.

- **Barnes JD, Ollerenshaw JH, Whitfield CP. 1995***b*. Effects of elevated CO_2 and/or O_3 on the growth, development and physiology of wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). Global Change Biology 1: 129–142.
- Blank LW, Payer H-D, Pfirrmann T, Gnatz G, Kloos M, Runkel K-H, Schmolke W, Strube D, Rehfuess KE. 1990. Effects of ozone, acid mist and soil characteristics on clonal Norway spruce (*Picea abies* Karst.) – An introduction to the joint 14-month tree exposure experiment in closed chambers. Environmental Pollution 64: 189–207.
- Bosch C, Pfannkuch E, Rehfuess KE, Runkel K-H, Schramel P, Senser M., 1986. Einfluß einer Düngung mit Magnesium und Calcium, von Ozon und saurem Nebel auf Frosthärte, Ernährungszustand und Biomasseproduktion junger Fichten (*Picea abies* [L.] Karst.). Forstwissenschaftliches Zentralblatt 105: 218-229.
- **Brown KA, Roberts TM. 1988.** Effects of ozone on foliar leaching in Norway spruce (*Picea abies* [L.] Karst.): confounding factors due to NO_x production during O_3 generation. *Environmental Pollution* **55**: 55–73.
- **Brown KR. 1991.** Carbon dioxide enrichment accelerates the decline in nutrient status and relative growth rate of *Populus tremuloides* Michx. seedlings. *Tree Physiology* 8: 161-173.
- **Ceulemans R, Mousseau M. 1994.** Effects of elevated atmospheric CO₂ on woody plants. *New Phytologist* **127**: 425–446.
- Chiu S-T, Anton LH, Ewers FW, Hammerschmidt R, Pregitzer KS. 1992. Effects of fertilization on epicuticular wax morphology of needle leaves of Douglas fir. Pseudotsuga menziesii (Pinaceae). American Journal of Botany 79: 149–154.
- Davison AW, Barnes JD. 1992. Patterns of air pollution, the use of the Critical Levels concept as a basis for abatement strategy. In: Newsom MD, ed. Managing the Human Impact on the Natural Environment: Patterns and Processes. New York: Bellhaven Publishing Corporation, 109–129.
- **Eamus D, Jarvis PG. 1989.** The direct effects of increase in global atmospheric CO_2 concentration on natural and commercial temperate trees and forests. Advances in Ecological Research 19: 1–55.
- Fajer ED, Bowers MD, Bazzaz FA. 1992. The effects of nutrients and enriched CO₂ environments on the production of carbon-based allelochemicals in *Plantago*: a test of the carbon/ nutrient balance hypothesis. *American Naturalist* 140: 707–723.
- Garrec J-P, Laitat E, Rose C. 1993. Les arbres d'aujord'hui dans l'atmosphere de demain. La Recherche 258: 1174–1175.
- Geisser S, Greenhouse SW. 1958. An extension of Box's results on the use of the *F*-distribution in multivariate analysis. *Annals* of Mathematical Statistics 29: 885–891.
- **Gundersson CA, Wullschleger SD. 1994.** Photosynthetic acclimation in trees to rising atmospheric CO₂: a broader perspective. *Photosynthesis Research* **39**: 369–388.
- Heath RL, Castillo FJ. 1988. Membrane disturbances in response to air pollutants. In: Schulte-Hostede S, Darall NM, Blank LW, Wellburn AR. eds. *Air Pollution and Plant Metabolism*. London: Elsevier Applied Science, 55-75.
- Hüttl RF. 1985. Neuartige Waldschäden und Nährelementversorgung von Fichtenbeständen (*Picea abies* [L.] Karst.) in Südwestdeutschland. *Freiburger Bodenklundl. Abhandlungen Bd.* 16: 1–195.
- Jäger HJ, Unsworth M, De Temmerman L, Mathy P. 1992. Effects of Air Pollution on Agricultural Crops in Europe. Air

- Kirschbaum MUF, King DA, Comins HN, McMurtie RE, Medlyn BE, Pongracic S, Murty D, Keith H, Raison RJ, Khanna PK, Sheriff DW. 1994. Modelling forest response to increasing CO₂ concentration under nutrient-limited conditions. *Plant*, *Cell and Environment* 17: 1081–1099.
- **Lemon ER. 1983.** CO_2 and plants: the response of plants to rising levels of atmospheric carbon dioxide. Boulder CO, USA: Westview Press.
- Lucas PW, Rantanen L, Mehlhorn H. 1993. Needle chlorosis in sitka spruce following a three-year exposure to low concentrations of ozone: changes in mineral content, pigmentation and ascorbic acid. New Phytologist 124: 265–275.
- Martin JT, Juniper BE. 1970. The cuticles of plants. Edinburgh: Edward Arnold.
- Marschner H. 1986. Mineral nutrition of higher plants. London: Academic Press.
- Meiwes KJ, König N, Khanna PK, Prenzel J, Ulrich B. 1984. Chemische Untersuchungsverfahren für Mineralböden, Auflagehumus und Wurzeln zur Charakterisierung und Bewertung der Versauerung in Waldböden. Berichte des Forschungszentrums Waldökosysteme/Waldsterben 7: 1-67.
- Mortensen LV. 1995. Effect of carbon dioxide concentration on biomass production and partitioning in *Betula pubescens* Ehrh. seedlings at different ozone and temperature regimes. *Environmental Pollution* 87: 337–343.
- Norby RJ, O'Neill EG, Luxmore RJ. 1986. Effects of atmospheric CO₂ enrichment on the growth and mineral nutrition of *Quercus alba* seedlings in nutrient-poor soil. *Plant Physiology* 82: 83–89.
- Norby RJ, O'Neill EG, Hood WG, Luxmore RJ. 1987. Carbon allocation, root exudation and mycorrhizal colonization of *Pinus* echinata seedlings grown under C₂ enrichment. Tree Physiology 3: 203–210.
- **Oberbauer SF, Sionit N, Hastings SJ, Oechel WC. 1986.** Effects of CO_2 enrichment and nutrition on growth, photosynthesis, and nutrient concentration of Alaskan tundra plant species. *Canadian Journal of Botany* **64**: 2993–2998.
- **Ogner G. 1993.** No general effect of ozone on foliar nutrient concentrations in mature scions of grafted *Picea abies* trees. *Environmental Pollution* 82: 197–200.
- **O'Neill EG, Luxmore RJ, Norby RJ. 1987.** Elevated atmospheric CO₂: effects on seedling growth, nutrient uptake and rhizosphere bacterial populations of *Liriodendron tulipifera* L. *Plant and Soil* **104**: 3–11.
- Payer H-D, Bosch C, Blank LW, Eisenmann T, Runkel K-H. 1986a. Beschreibung der Expositionskammern und der Versuchsbedingungen bei der Belastung von Pflanzen mit Luftschadstoffen und Klimastress. Forstwissenshcaftliches Zentralblatt 105: 207-218.
- Payer H-D, Blank LW, Bosch C, Gnatz G. 1986 b. Simultaneous exposure of forest trees to various pollutants and climatic stress. Water, Air and Soil Pollution 31: 485–491.
- Penkett SA. 1988. Indications and causes of ozone increase in the troposphere. In: Rowland FS, Isaksen ISA, eds. *The Changing Atmosphere* London: John Wiley & Sons Ltd., 91–103.
- **Petterson R, McDonald JS. 1994.** Effects of nitrogen supply on the acclimation of photosynthesis to elevated CO_2 . *Photosynthesis Research* **39**: 389–400.
- Pfirrmann T. 1992. Wechselwirkungen von Ozon, Kohlendioxid und Wassermangel bei zwei Klonen unterschiedlich mit Kalium ernährter Fichten. Ph.D. thesis, Justus-Liebig Unviersität, Giessen, Germany.
- Pfirrmann T, Runkel K-H, Schramel P, Eisenmann T. 1990.

Pollution Research Report 46, CEC Brussels.

- Keeling CD, Bacastow RB, Carter AF, Piper SC, Whorf TP, Heimann M, Mook WG, Roeloffzen H. 1989. A 3dimensional model of atmospheric C transport based on oberved winds. I. Analysis of observational data. In: Peterson DH. ed. Aspects of Climate Variability in the Pacific and the Western Americas. Geophysical Monographs 55: 165-235.
- **Keller T, Mattysek R. 1990.** Limited compensation of O_3 stress by potassium in Norway spruce. *Environmental Pollution* 67: 1–14.
- Kimball BA, Rosenberg NJ, Allen LH, Heichel GH, Stuber CW, Kissel DE, Ernst S. (1990. Impact of Carbon Dioxide, Trace Gases, and Climate Change on Global Agriculture. American Society of Agronomy special publication No. 53, Madison, USA.

Mineral nutrient supply, content and leaching in Norway spruce exposed for 14 months to ozone and acid mist. *Environmental Pollution* **64**: 229–253.

- Polle A, Chakrabati K, Chakrabati S, Seifert F, Schramel P, Rennenberg H. 1992. Antioxidants and manganese deficiency in needles of Norway spruce (*Picea abies L.*) trees. *Plant Physiology* 99: 1084–1089.
- Polle A, Pfirrmann T, Chakrabati S, Rennenberg H. 1993.
 The effects of enhanced ozone and enhanced carbon dioxide concentrations on biomass, pigments and antioxidative enzymes in spruce needles (*Picea abies* L.). *Plant, Cell and Environment* 16: 311-316.
- **Prügel B. 1994.** Contribution a l'etude des modifications chimiques des cires cuticulaires de Picea abies (L.) Karst. et de Picea stichensis (Bong) Carr. en relation avec le deperissement forestier

278 T. Pfirrmann and others

et l'augmentation du CO_2 dans l'atmosphere. Ph.D. thesis, University of Nancy I, France.

- **Rantanen L, Palomäki V, Holopainen T. 1994.** Interactions between exposure to O_3 and nutrient status of trees: effects on nutrient content and uptake, growth, mycorrhiza and needle ultrastructure. New Phytologist 128: 674–688.
- **Riederer M. 1989.** The cuticle of conifers: structure composition and transport properties. *Ecological Studies* **77**: 157–192.
- Roberts TM, Skeffington RA, Blank LW. 1989. Causes of Type 1 spruce decline in Europe. *Forestry* 62: 179–222.
- Sandermann H, Wellburn AR, Heath RL. 1996. Forest Decline and Ozone. Ecological Studies Series. Berlin: Springer-Verlag (in press).
- Scheffer SA, Schachtschabel GS. 1989. Lehrbuch der Bodenkunde. Stuttgart: Enke Verlag.
- **Schramel P. 1988.** ICP and DCP emission spectrometry for trace element analysis in biomedical and environmental samples. A review. *Spectrochimica Acta* **43B**: 881–896.
- Skelly JM, Innes JL. 1994. Waldsterben in the forest of Central Europe and Eastern North America: fantasy or reality? *Plant Disease* 78: 1021–1031.
- Steffen I, Schramel P. 1988. Bestimmung von Stickstoff in Fichtennadeln. Labor Praxis 12: 1354–1361.

- Taylor GE, Johnson DW, Andersen CP. 1994. Air pollution and forest ecosystems: A regional to global perspective. *Ecological Applications* 4: 662–689.
- Tukey HB. 1970. The leaching of substances from plants. Annual Review of Plant Physiology 21: 305-324.
- Van der Eerden L, Tonneijck A, Jarosz W, Bestebroer S, Dueck T. 1993. Influence of nitrogenous air pollutants on carbon dioxide and ozone effects on vegetation. In: Jackson MB, Black CR eds. Interacting Stresses on Plants in a Changing Climate vol. 16, NATO ASI Series. Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 125-138.
- Waring RH, Schlesinger WH. 1985. Forest ecosystems : concepts and management. Florida: Academic Press.
- Wellburn AR, Barnes JD, Lucas PW, McLeod AR, Mansfield TA. 1996. Controlled O₃ exposures and field observations of O₃ effects in the UK. In: Sandermann H, Wellburn AR, Heath RL eds. *Forest Decline and Ozone*, Ecological Studies Series. Berlin: Springer-Verlag (in press).
- Ylimarto A, Pääkkönen E, Holopainen T, Rita H. 1994. Unbalanced nutrient status and epicuticular wax of Scots pine needles. Canadian Journal of Forest Research 24: 522-532.
- Zak DR, Pregitzer KS, Curtis PS, Teeri JA, Fogel R, Randlett DL. 1993. Elevated atmospheric CO₂ and feedback between carbon and nitrogen cycles. *Plant and Soil* 151: 105–117.

This document is a scanned copy of a printed document. No warranty is given about the accuracy of the copy. Users should refer to the original published version of the material.